



Teacher Feedback that Grows Student Understanding  
A Professional Development Role Play Activity

**Preparation: [Complete a 5-step module](#) (30 minutes) to prepare for this roleplay. To prepare you will: 1. Learn the student task used in this practice session. 2. Learn a student centered approach to providing feedback.**

During this role-play practice session, you will work in groups of 6 people to role play a small group discussion with 5 students and 1 teacher. These numbers can be modified based on your group's needs. For example, if you only have 4 people, teachers can role play two students. If you have 10 people, you can have 4 people observe.

To begin this activity, you will first assign roles. Who will play the role of the teacher? Who will play the role of each of our students - Savannah, Dev, Harrison, Jasmine, and Ethan? One note to consider as you assign roles: do not think about students in terms of generalizations or socially constructed stereotypes (for example, a student with disabilities or an English Learner). Instead, be yourself and focus on the strengths the students bring to the group and the specific needs they show in this particular task, based on their initial responses.

Below is an agenda of the different parts of this role play activity to guide your experience. Agenda (estimated time: 15 minutes):

1. Assign roles (Teacher, Savannah, Dev, Harrison, Jasmine, Ethan)
2. Understand the student task. Students are answering a comprehension question of a nonfiction article from the New York Times describing how scientists discovered water on the moon.
3. Role-play Script 1
4. Take 5 minutes to reflect on the role play. Work together to fill in what you believe each of the codes in Script 1 should be, then compare with our answer key. Discuss discrepancies in your group.
5. Work together to add two lines of teacher instruction to the script to help increase the quality of student responses. Modify the student responses based on this new teacher feedback. Replay the role play with these new additions.
6. Reflect individually about what new things you heard in the group and how that affected students' responses, answering questions A and B below. Then, engage in a [Domino Discover](#) discussion to talk as a whole group.

- a. How did the updated teacher feedback improve the quality of student responses?
  - b. Which codes did you focus on in your updated teacher feedback?
7. End the professional development by sharing your overall takeaways from this experience.
  - a. What did you learn about giving feedback to students?
  - b. How can your feedback lead to the improvement of the quality of students' responses?
8. If time, repeat this process with Script 2. Compare the teacher feedback and student responses of Scripts 1 and 2, thinking about which is the stronger example and why.

**Script 1:**

Ethan: Um, excuse me, I shouldn't be in this group. I already know all about space.

Teacher: Hi Ethan. We would love to have you share your background knowledge with the group (Code: \_\_\_\_\_). Today we will be talking about how we can use a text to help us answer a question. We will think about how we found our answers, and how we can improve upon them. (Code: \_\_\_\_\_)

Teacher: Savannah and Dev, I'd like to start with you. Can you share with us how you found your answer of the microscope? (Code: \_\_\_\_\_)

Savannah or Dev: Yeah, so we looked at the text and it says you'd need a scientific tool called a microscope to look really closely. But I don't understand why our answer is wrong.

Teacher: Thank you for sharing that! I like how you used the text to find your answer (Code: \_\_\_\_\_). However, I'm concerned about your use of the terms look and find (Code: \_\_\_\_\_). When we look at something, we already have the object we are looking at. However, when we find something, we discover it for the first time (Code: \_\_\_\_\_). I'd like you and Dev to read the text again and highlight a tool that is used specifically to find the water for the first time (Code: \_\_\_\_\_).

Savannah or Dev: Ok, we'll look again.

Teacher: Great! Jasmine, Harrison, and Ethan, I'd like to work with you now. Jasmine, how did you find your answer? (Code: \_\_\_\_\_)

Jasmine: Well I was looking at the text and saw that it said scientists used the small machine to find the ice deposits.

Teacher: Thank you for clarifying. You did a great job finding a machine in the text (Code: \_\_\_\_\_). Harrison, how did you find your answer? (Code: \_\_\_\_\_)

Harrison: When I was reading, it said that scientists found craters full of water on the moon and that has our key word water, so I figured that had to be right. Also, I've been to NASA so I know that scientists use lots of equipment like oxygen tanks, masks, suits.

Teacher: You did a great job using our key words and that's a wonderful experience of visiting NASA! (Code: \_\_\_\_\_). Now, Ethan, can you share how you found your response and then I can provide more feedback to you, Harrison, and Jasmine together? (Code: \_\_\_\_\_)

Ethan: Yeah sure, I already know lots about space so I know that scientists use oxygen tanks.

Teacher: I love that you're bringing in your background knowledge! (Code: \_\_\_\_\_) So for the three of you, Jasmine, my concern is that you did not include the specific name of the machine you chose. Harrison, your response needs to include a machine. Ethan, your response needs a machine that is mentioned in the text (Code: \_\_\_\_\_). My suggestion is that all of you work together to re-read the text and highlight the specific name of the machine used to find the water. Jasmine, you can show Harrison and Ethan where you got your response and then all three of you can work to find the specific name (Code: \_\_\_\_\_).

Jasmine: Ok, we can do that.

Teacher: Savannah and Dev, did you find a machine? (Code: \_\_\_\_\_)

Dev: Yeah, we looked again and we found the small machine that Jasmine was talking about.

Jasmine: Yeah, I just looked again and it says the small machine is called the lunar orbiter.

Teacher: Fantastic job! Yes, the machine scientists used to discover water is called the lunar orbiter (Code: \_\_\_\_\_) Now, I'd like you all to think for a moment about your work today and use the following sentence starters to share your growth: "I started out thinking..." "Now I think..." Alright, so for example, you can start by saying, "I started out thinking" and then you would say your prior response. Then you can say "and now I think this way because" and you can explain how your thinking has changed. (Code: \_\_\_\_\_)

Dev: Oh we would love to, but I just checked the time and it's time for us to go to lunch.

## Answer Key “Scripts” for RSU Simulation

### **Script 1: Teacher focuses on clarifying, valuing, and offering concerns/suggestions to students**

Ethan: Um, excuse me. I shouldn't be in this group. I already know all about space.

Teacher: Hi Ethan. We would love to have you share your background knowledge with the group (Low level - 110.3). Today we will be talking about how we can use a text to help us answer a question. We will think about how we found our answers, and how we can improve upon them. (Purpose - 220.1)

Teacher: Savannah and Dev, I'd like to start with you. Can you share with us how you found your answer of the microscope? (Clarify - 230.1)

Savannah or Dev: Yeah, so we looked at the text and it says you'd need a scientific tool called a microscope to look real closely. But I don't understand why our answer is wrong.

Teacher: Thank you for sharing that! I like how you used the text to find your answer (Value - 310.1). However, I'm concerned about your use of the terms look and find (Concern - 410.2). When we look at something, we already have the object we are looking at. However, when we find something, we discover it for the first time (Explain - 210.4). I'd like you and Dev to read the text again and highlight a tool that is used specifically to find the water for the first time (Suggestion - 420.3).

Savannah or Dev: Ok, we'll look again.

Teacher: Great! Jasmine, Harrison, and Ethan, I'd like to work with you now. Jasmine, how did you find your answer? (Clarify - 230.1)

Jasmine: Well I was looking at the text and saw that it said scientists used the small machine to find the ice deposits.

Teacher: Thank you for clarifying. You did a great job finding a machine in the text (Value - 310.1). Harrison, how did you find your answer? (Clarify - 230.1)

Harrison: When I was reading, it said that scientists found craters full of water on the moon and that has our key word water, so I figured that had to be right. Also, I've been to NASA so I know that scientists use lots of equipment like oxygen tanks, masks, suits.

Teacher: You did a great job using our key words and that's a wonderful experience of visiting NASA! (Value - 310.1). Now, Ethan, can you share how you found your response and then I can provide more feedback to you, Harrison, and Jasmine together? (Clarify - 230.1)

Ethan: Yeah sure, I already know lots about space so I know that scientists use oxygen tanks.

Teacher: I love that you're bringing in your background knowledge! (Value - 310.1) So for the three of you, Jasmine, my concern is that you did not include the specific name of the machine you chose. Harrison, your response needs to include a machine. Ethan, your response needs a machine that is mentioned in the text (Concern - 410.2). My suggestion is that all of you work together to re-read the text and highlight the specific name of the machine used to find the water. Jasmine, you can show Harrison and Ethan where you got your response and then all three of you can work to find the specific name (Suggestion - 420.3).

Jasmine: Ok, we can do that.

Teacher: Savannah and Dev, did you find a machine? (Low level - 120.4)

Dev: Yeah, we looked again and we found the small machine that Jasmine was talking about.

Jasmine: Yeah, I just looked again and it says the small machine is called the lunar orbiter.

Teacher: Fantastic job! Yes, the machine scientists used to discover water is called the lunar orbiter (Low level - 110.4) Now, I'd like you all to think for a moment about your work today and use the following sentence starters to share your growth: "I started out thinking..." "Now I think..." Alright, so for example, you can start by saying, "I started out thinking" and then you would say your prior response. Then you can say "and now I think this way because" and you can explain how your thinking has changed. (Reflection - 530.1)

Dev: Oh we would love to, but I just checked the time and it's time for us to go to lunch.

\*\*\*\*\*

**Script 2: Teacher focuses mostly on low-level feedback but includes a few examples of some higher level feedback responses**

Ethan: Um, excuse me, I shouldn't be in this group. I already know all about space.

Teacher: We're so glad to have you in this group, and you can kind of help us to follow the prompts of the question that we were answering so I'm so glad you're here. (110.3) [RERID 67, Transcript 4010] So Ethan, what was your answer to our question? (120.4)

Ethan: Yeah I said that scientists used a lot of equipment, like oxygen tanks.

Teacher: Great job! (110.1) And Jasmine, what was your response? (120.4)

Jasmine: I said NASA sent a small machine.

Teacher: I love that! Can you tell us where you found that answer in the text? (230.2)

Jasmine: Yeah I found it in paragraph two and I don't understand why my answer is wrong.

Teacher: Your answer is not wrong, I think that there are multiple answers here, right, so we've identified one equipment. (110.2) [RERID 67, Transcript 4045] And I think Savannah and Dev identified another piece of equipment. Can you share your response? (120.4)

Savannah: Yeah we said you'd need a scientific tool called a microscope to look really closely.

Teacher: How did you come up with your answer? (230.1) [RERID 105, Transcript 1107]

Savannah: Yeah, so we looked at the text and it says you'd need a scientific tool called a microscope to look really closely and we thought, well how can you find the water if you can't even see it?

Teacher: Yes, I love that you used the text (310.1). Yes, Harrison.

Harrison: Yeah I've been to NASA so I know that scientists use lots of equipment like oxygen tanks, masks, suits.

Teacher: Yeah, that's great. That's a great connection. How neat that you've been to NASA before I love that. (110.3) [RERID 83, Transcript 1085]

Harrison: Yeah, it was really cool!

Teacher: That's wonderful. Now before we finish, I have a question I'd like to ask you all. When we're answering questions like this again, what's something that we need to make sure we do when we're answering the question? (520.1) [RERID 113, Transcript 1023]. Savannah?

Savannah: Yeah, um, I used the text in my response so maybe I can do that with other questions.

Teacher: That's great! (110.1). Anyone else? Ethan?

Ethan: I also used information I already knew because I know lots about space.

Teacher: Yes, that can also be helpful. (110.1). Dev?

Dev: Yeah it's actually time for us to go to lunch, so we'll see you later Teacher. Bye!

\*\*\*\*\*

### *Possible Types of Teacher Feedback*

#### 210.2

- “So let's think about before we actually look at water with the microscope what equipment did the scientists use to discover the water they found on the moon, so they use the microscope after they had found it, but what did they use to find it.” [RERID 67, Transcript 4010]
- “Absolutely so so let's first like talk about that question. When we say the word equipment what what do we mean what does equipment mean.” [RERID 73, Transcript 4009]
- “Absolutely, yes, that is what evidence is it's called textual evidence, it means you're drawing your answer from that source.” [RERID 73, Transcript 4009]
- “What equipment did scientists to use to discover water on the moon. That would be your question. So that question didn't ask anything about what they found, as what did they use to find it.” [RERID 78, Transcript 1014]

#### 210.4

- “Yes, but let me ask you a further question. Could they just send a microscope to space and find water? Or do you think that they need some sort of machine to discover the water.” [RERID 271, Transcript 2031]
- “Because we might think it could be the microscope, because that's another equipment that's thrown into the text right but that equipment was used only after the water was discovered.” [RERID 273, Transcript 2040]
- “But we're looking for the specific name of that machine. Does anyone remember what it's called?” [RERID 388, Transcript 2003]

230.1

- “All right, Jazmin, can you tell me more about your answer? What made you say NASA sent a small machine?” [RERID 71, Transcript 4076]
- “Chris, I want to start with your answer. So Chris, can you tell me more about what made you say your answer?” [RERID 71, Transcript 4077]
- “How did you come up with your answer?” [RERID 105, Transcript 1107]

310.1

- “I love that you guys are really using the reading and pointing to specific parts and sentences in the reading to help.” [RERID 67, Transcript 4045]
- “I love that you brought in that background knowledge, Luis. That fact about the scientists and astronauts needing those oxygen tanks, that’s really awesome background knowledge.” [RERID 71, Transcript 4076]
- “Chris, you have found some specific evidence in the text you pulled it right out. Scientists have found craters full of water on the moon, and that is absolutely true. And I’m really proud of you for finding that.” [RERID 82, Transcript 1133]

410.2

- “They did send a small machine to discover water on the moon. But what was the name? We’re looking for more detail. What was the name of the small machine?” [RERID 95, Transcript 1187]
- “So although it’s really great that you have a lot of background knowledge we have to look at the the paragraph to answer our question.” [RERID 117, Transcript 1032]
- “Now you talked in your response about scientists finding craters on the moon, which is absolutely correct, but I am concerned that your answer doesn’t completely align with what the question is asking.” [RERID 484, Transcript 4079]

420.2

- “If we go back into the text, we can see the type of small machine that they sent and so we can give that a name. So that when we respond to the question we’re being specific with our answer.” [RERID 125, Transcript 1035]
- “So the best place to start is the key words in the question and then going back to those headings to try and see if we can look underneath that heading for an answer.” [RERID 131, Transcript 1052]
- “So whenever we’re looking at passages, we really want to focus on textual evidence. Now textual evidence is when you have a question and you refer back to your passage to find the exact answer, or as close as possible.” [RERID 115, Transcript 1115]

530.1



- “Alright, so for example, you can start by saying, “I started out thinking” and then you would say your prior response. Then you can say “and now I think this way because” and you can explain how your thinking has changed.” [RERID 268, Transcript 2048]
- “So we’re gonna take a minute to turn around to your partner next to you and you’re going to talk about what are your takeaway from the revision process.” [RERID 268, Transcript 2049]
- “Before our conversation I thought that the answer was This or I didn’t know the answer, or I was still confused, or just before our conversation, this is what I thought, and then, after the conversation that we just had now, I think.” [RERID 483, Transcript 4061]
- “Okay, so who can tell me what they did to correct their answer? So how did you go about correcting your answer?” [RERID 101, Transcript 1049]